

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1- save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4- demolish	summary
1	Ted	Preston		n	x				Retain the core hall (auditorium) for acoustics and ease of use by performers. Assume strengthening would include upgrade of kitchen and toilet. Guess this is the most cost effective option. An upgraded hall would attract more bookings like conferences, weddings and exhibitions.
2	Richard	Kirby		n	x				Support the conservation plan to keep the hall "as is where is" as long as possible, and strengthen to comply with earthquake standards.
3	Ken & Helen	McGillivray	Pain Estate	n	x				The Town Hall is unique. The tragic earthquakes in Christchurch have added extra hype to the [Town Hall] situation. Strengthen the existing building and upgrade the toilet and kitchen facilities. The proscenium arch would not look right in a new building, and the history of the building belongs to the past and current people of the town.
4	Pip	Stokes		n				x	Would like to know the cost of earthquake strengthening. Would rather see money spent on improvements to water and sewerage systems. Demolish the existing hall and do not replace. Use the façade as an embellishment to the Square.
5	Michael	Honey		n	x				The Town Hall must be saved. Would like to see it strengthened and improved, recreating a space like that would be a big spend.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1-save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4-demolish	summary
6	Trish	Harris		n	x				Hall to remain and renovated as proposed plans.
7	John Klapproth	Andrea Jaretzki		n				x	Strongly supports option 4 - to demolish and not rebuild. There are more important things to spend our money on. There are other venue options in nearby townships, e.g. Carterton has a modern function centre.
8	Helen	Forlong		n	x				The Town Hall is an important part of Martinborough's history and its current attraction as an historic NZ town. Its use as a performance space and wedding venue could earn funds for Council to use to improve Martinborough facilities. It is one of the town's taonga.
9	Gay	Reed		n			x		Demolish the existing Town Hall. It has no real architectural merit. Save worthwhile old buildings. Prefer a new building of character design to fit in with the rest of the heritage precinct. Suggest utilising the old courthouse as it would respond well to restoration.
10	Robyn	Ramsden		n		x			Difficult to make a recommendation when the costs of each option are not provided. Preserve the façade and arch and build a new hall of similar floor area. Suggest checking the work done on the Pantheon in Athens as they have stabilised the buildings while preserving the essence of the complex.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1-save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4-demolish	summary
11	Diana	Broadhead		n	(x)	x			Option 1 or 2, the costs and projected uses for the building are important. The Hall needs a larger stage, particularly the backstage area, larger tearoom space, made warmer, toilets open for each occasion and at night when the public toilet is closed.
12	Annette & Graham	Clark		n	x				Option 1
13	Georgie	Harris		n	x		(x)		Option 1 as long as it is the cheapest option, otherwise number 3 build a new hall. The town could fundraise to keep costs down.
14	Helen	Hobbs		n				x	Option 4 - the other costs are too great for the use the Hall would get. Suggest the money is spent in Featherston for decent footpaths and streets, and a decent entrance to the town.
15	Veronica	McKee		n			x	(x)	Partially demolish the hall and build an all season sound shell, with outdoor seating made of cement and river boulders. Alternatively, demolish the hall and replace it with a car park and bus bay.
16	Neil	Ginn		n				x	Demolish the hall, sell the land, add money to reserves fund and reduce rates for all.
17	Trevor	Petersen		n			x		Strengthening would be a waste of money. The Hall has character be one has to be realistic and a new purpose-built hall would be of greater value.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1-save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4-demolish	summary
18	Rhona	Fraser		n		x			option 2
19	Josef	Torok		n				x	Demolish the Hall. Join together with Carterton District or the whole Wairarapa and call it the Wairarapa District Council.
20	Jude	Nelson		n			x		The current hall is past its use by date. Martinborough has a lot of accommodation so a stadium like Wanganui or Palmerston North would be of value. Wellington has no wooden sprung floor stadiums for roller sports, karate, dance etc. Query: what happened to the statues that were on the Hall roof?
21	Rachel	Pool		n				x	Demolish Hall and do not rebuild. No other option.
22	Guy	Walmsley		n			x		It is time to move on. Nice though the old façade is, it lost it when the gargoyles were removed.
23	Liz	Bondy		n				x	demolish only
24	Ed	Hudson		n				x	Stop putting good money after bad. Oppose keeping a building just because it is old and there are plenty of old buildings in Martinborough. The Hall is ugly; suggest an open space with trees and seating.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1- save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4- demolish	summary
25	Barbara	Paige		n				x	The building is ugly and not a good reminder of the past. A new hall would sit empty 90 % of the time. There are plenty of ugly old buildings in South Wairarapa (ref Featherston). An open space would be more useful during Martinborough events. A new building, if built, should support a variety of uses for the public.
26	George	Webby		n	x				Strongly support option 1. The older style town hall is vanishing at an alarming rate. Aware of money required to refurbish, but the Hall is surely one that needs to be preserved. A Town Hall the size of Martinborough's cannot cater for a variety of activities such as theatre, netball, contract bridge, etc. It must remain a hall that caters to town meetings, theatre and music events.
27	Jack	Hutchings		n	x				Strengthening is the only option as the hall is part of South Wairarapa's heritage and should be kept for the benefit of the whole district. It is a fine example of early 20th century architecture and our descendants should see their predecessors' living and recreational spaces. Hopefully once modernised and strengthened it will become the centre of the district again.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1-save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4-demolish	summary
28	Gill & Jack	Luttrell		n				x	No community wishes to lose an historic building, but the South Wairarapa has three other large halls (Featherston, Greytown, Carterton) suitable for large functions, all of which are new or wooden and only 10-15 minutes away from each other. These buildings are all maintained by ratepayers and the expense of options 1, 2 and 3 is not justifiable. Don't overburden the whole district with major expenditures on the Martinborough Town Hall. That money could be better spent on covered pools, sportsfields, improved libraries and other services. The history of the hall can be preserved through media and memorabilia.
29	Elizabeth	Stevens		y	x				Hall is an asset for the community. The main hall's acoustics is the most valuable asset and would never be reproduced to the same quality (in a new building). Martinborough lacks a community space other than the Town Hall. It would be short sighted to take it down.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1- save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4- demolish	summary
30	Hiatt	Cox		y			x		Must consider what uses a 'new' Town Hall will have. A Town Hall should attract people to the town during the week to benefit retailers and accommodation providers. Suggest a conference centre that is effectively marketed to get a return on money spent. Suggest that Council contracts out the management of the hall to a third party.
31	Lindy	Pacey		y		x			Suggest the façade and arch be incorporated in the park if keeping the façade is too expensive. Need to know the cost and time frames for option 1, 2 and 3.
32	Noel	Thomas		y	x				Strengthen to a reasonable standard for safety.
33	Ro	Griffiths	Lismore	n	x				Would like to see hall refurbished for use for concerts, live theatre, flower shows, art and craft exhibitions, indoor sports, private functions. The engineer who spoke at the initial meeting was optimistic about new technologies available to strengthen the hall. Consider that strengthening would be cheaper than a new building.
34	Noel	Bassett		n	x				Strengthening would be cheap to do.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1- save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4- demolish	summary
35	Christine	Allanson		n			x		Incorporate the library into the facility instead of having a "green room". It doesn't make sense to pay rent for the present library building and to maintain and upgrade a building they don't own. A library near the skatepark, playground and public toilets would be ideal. The hall could be used by the Library for holiday programmes.
36	Patricia	Thomas		n			x		Need a building that is environmentally and socially sustainable and sustaining. The existing building is incapable of those requirements and so should go. Replace it with a building that reflects who we are today and who we will be over the next century. Features (of the current building) that pay homage to the past could be retained.
37	John & Dian	Marment		n	x				Strengthen the existing hall.
38	Victoria	Jones		n	x				Support option 1 with improvements to shortcomings: Inadequate backstage facilities are difficult for disabled and elderly people. Dressing room area is also inadequate. External surroundings do not enhance the character of the hall. Public toilets are quite near the entrance and there is a lack of attractive landscaping. As a classical musician, appreciate the excellent acoustics of the Town Hall, much better than the new Greytown Hall. Suggest we make our Town Hall stronger rather than destroy it.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1- save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4- demolish	summary
39	Honor	Clark		n			x		The cost of keeping the hall in any form probably outweighs any benefit to the community. Common sense to start again with option 3. Options 1&2 recognise the history of the building, but it is not listed by the NZHPT so is it really worthy of protection? We will have to fund this ourselves. Option 3 is expensive but will provide a modern, new facility rather than a burden.
40	Michelle	Morris		n	x	(x)			Want to preserve the building as it is a significant part of the charm of the town square. A town hall is an essential part of small town cultural life.
41	Alan	Jacks		n			x		It is impossible to make it safe in the event of an earthquake so demolish it and rebuild something with a similar front appearance.
42	Raymond & Shirley	Lind		n			x		The existing hall overpowers the surrounding area, and rebuilding with old façade will look like a patched up job. Option three is a step toward the future for the community and the surrounding area for many years to come. Suggest another option to leave the existing floor, if it is in good order, and build a hall that that floor area.
43	Theresa	Moran		n				x	Ratepayers have had enough of paying more and more rates. Pull down the used-by building. There are other halls in Martinborough that could fill one's needs.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1-save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4-demolish	summary
44	Nolene	White		n			x		Worked at Featherston County Council during WWII and was shown plans for Town Hall. The full plan, which included an indoor sports bowl, Council chambers and Council offices, was never completed. The Hall holds a lot of memories and different events (listed in full submission). The Hall has served its community well but it has become inadequate, impracticable and deemed unsafe. Upgrading at huge expense won't change anything. It is time to move on and look to the future with a new and safe Town Hall, but memories remain.
45	David	Kershaw		y	x				Believe earthquake strengthening the only option to support. The building has history and we have to look after our noble old buildings for future generations. No other building matches its acoustics and comfortable size, and a certain amount of expenditure has gone toward strengthening already, which should not be forgotten. Repairs and development can be spread over many years and if there are cost over-runs, we will still have a hall! To the critics who say the hall is not used enough; neither is the Michael Fowler Centre nor Carnegie Hall, but they play an important part in the life of their cities, as does the Martinborough Town Hall.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1-save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4-demolish	summary
46	Graham & Leonie	Stephenson		n	x				Look forward to seeing progress on renovation of town hall, which is a landmark worth preserving.
47	Ash	Reed		n			x		Suggest demolishing the existing building, moving the old courthouse to the site to be the library, and build a new single storey function centre that is a character building in design.
48	Jim	Hedley		y				x	Demolish and do not rebuild.
49	Angela	Sears		y			x		Preference is for option 3, possibly with a retained façade. The present hall has fine acoustics, which are a must in any replacement building. Existing hall has many unsatisfactory features (small spaces, stage, balcony, inconvenient supper room, awkward entrance steps & unattractive surrounds). A new building is desirable as long as its maximum use is promoted locally and more widely. Suggest much of the existing materials are re-used from the demolished building. Martinborough community has made amazing efforts previously in regard to fundraising (Medical Centre). Brainstorm with public for fundraising ideas and what the public want to get out of "their" new hall.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1- save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4- demolish	summary
50	Ian	Cresswell	Martinborough Town Hall Committee	y	x				Strengthen and improve the original 1912 building with as little change as possible. Have it run separately from SWDC with a Trust and a management board for finance and operational matters. Recommend demolishing any 2-storey part of the building that is below 12% of the building code. Strengthen the remaining parts of the hall either as one project, or in stages. Suggest that financing is handled by a Town Hall charitable trust instead of SWDC. Suggest moving the old Courthouse between the Hall and the museum and using it as an events centre, housing the I-Site and Library. Disestablish the MTH Committee and create a new one made up of community members only, with one councillor/liaison. This new committee could manage the hall, reporting to Council.
51	Karen	Coltman		n				x	Suggest selling the building and letting the new owner deal with the issues. Or don't repair it and just let it fall down. It would be better to spend money on other buildings and infrastructure in the district, for example Featherston Community Centre, footpaths, water supply and signage. Many ratepayers do not benefit from the hall as they actually do not go to Martinborough.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1- save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4- demolish	summary
52	Graeme	Thomson		n	x				Recommend preserving the main body of the hall, strengthen and progress with the 2009 improvements. Opposes option 3 as a new building would be a compromise trying to satisfy those wishing for "replaced grandeur" and those wanting "Multi-Multi" function. Undue weight may be given to demolition as an over reaction to the Christchurch earthquakes. Suggest a pragmatic approach to strengthening based on the age, type of construction and intended use. Hall is occupied about 1% (?) of the time and the probability of anyone being in it at the time of a significant EQ is so low, would rather money raised went to some other community projects. Don't be stampeded into unnecessary and expensive action.
53	John	Procter	and others	n			x		Suggest building an easy access multi use Town Hall with good acoustics and changed entrance orientation. The library should be attached to the complex. Part of the façade could be used as a sculpture in the grounds. Looked at hall without sentiment, and it has awkward and unsheltered access and facilities are well below par.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1-save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4-demolish	summary
54	Dave	Lowe			x				Important to protect historic buildings and redesigning and bringing up to standard is an essential progression in the life of this older building. Retaining and modernising will be more cost effective than replacing it. The tabled preliminary estimates are lacking in detail (in depth design and broad outline specifications). This is a concern if a decision is to be made on which option is viable.
55	Dinah	Airey		n					Need to investigate further other community facilities in conjunction with decisions about upgrading or rebuilding. Consult with younger members of community to see what they find important. Suggest a community centre that includes the Hall, the Library, Information Centre, Public toilets, Playground, museum.
56	Quentin	Wilson		n				x	Demolish and do not rebuild. Any other option would be expensive and not justified given the geographical spread of ratepayers.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1-save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4-demolish	summary
57	John	Moynihan		n				x?	Concerned the Council hasn't provided essential information including the annual cost of the existing hall, how often it is used and for what purpose, the revenue generated. First address fundamental questions: The need for a town hall, the annual cost of a town hall, who would use it and why, what revenue would be generated, what level of ratepayer subsidy would be required, alternative venues already available. Options 1, 2 3 should only be considered if a clearly defined need and projected income make it economically viable. Otherwise, option 4 is the only realistic option.
58	Sue	Delamare		n			x		Support option 3 with a library included. The idea that a wonderfully restored premise will automatically attract high quality performances is flawed. Max Stevens reported that consensus is to retain the building, but several people at last year's meeting questioned the building's safety, and the cost of continual upgrades to meet building standards. Like character buildings but the Hall has no particular historical merit and is in a remote location. Understand fond associations with the building, but problems retaining it are such that we should build a new auditorium/library/multipurpose building.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1- save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4- demolish	summary
59	William	Benfield		n			x	(x)	<p>Must consider the seismic risk of all public buildings to provide a combined solution. The library appears to fall short of meeting EQ requirements and must be included in this agenda. Option 1 would commit the community to perpetual fundraising as building codes change. If not now, base isolation could be required which could cost \$5-\$6.5 million. Option 2, cost/limitations to save facade not justified. Option 3, replacement with a library area, is the best long term option. An acoustics engineer can easily calculate proper acoustic design in a new building. Suggest the new building be re-sited to where the present public toilets are to ensure community needs are more central. The estimated cost of replacement (\$2,238,000) is actually a fraction of the actual cost to retain the existing building. If the community is unable to raise the funds for option 3, then prefer option 4.</p>

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1- save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4- demolish	summary
60	David	Bull		n	x				<p>The hall is a vaulable community asset with heritage value. Important that community can meet together and cooperate in activities. Strengthening will be a lower cost than an alternative facility and the expenditure does not need to be all at once. Active propotion of the upgraded facility can generate community activity into the future.</p>
61	Richard	Rudman		y					<p>The real question: The bigger question is "Does Martinborough need a Town Hall? If so what features/facilities should it have?" Suggest that there are enough civic halls in the district, church and marae halls could be used more. If a town hall is needed it would be better to invest in a new building where development costs are certain, rather than 'signing a blank cheque' for refurbishment (which is likely to be double the estimated costs), and the defined needs of the community can be met. The conservation plan: The plan suggests the hall is an historic place (but does not argue that the hall has any architectural significance) and is suitable for a variety of uses. The building is part of the town's history but is not itself historic. Proposed uses of existing hall are optimistic - the stage is too small (Wellington Youth Orchestra), acoustics are not suitable for all occasions (speaking in meetings),</p>

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1-save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4-demolish	summary
									<p>stage and backstage do not meet NZ Ballet's modest requirements.</p> <p>Building assessment: Current knowledge of the actual state of the building is incomplete. Refurbishing old buildings is a voyage of discovery with no certainty in outcome or costs.</p> <p>Royal Commission on Christchurch EQ may lead to further changes in legislation so wait until those findings are published. This all casts doubts on the accuracy of cost estimates.</p> <p>Do not support Options 1 and 2.</p> <p>Option 3: Unfortunate if present hall was simply replaced with a look-alike. Community should think outside the box to determine what facilities it needs and would use.</p> <p>Costs and funding: The actual costs and potential impact on rates is not clear. Operational costs of a future building not considered. Note that the availability and costs of building insurance has not been considered.</p>

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1- save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4- demolish	summary
62	Frank	Cornelissen	Martinborough Business Association	y					Decline to choose an option, but oppose option 4. Suggest community reassess the needs of current and future users. Consider bringing together a number of disparate amenities. Suggest a building that can accommodate indoor sport, library, iSite, toy library, plunket, with good flow between building and adjacent playground. Add professional meeting rooms and use as a conference centre. Appearance is secondary to the functionality and relationship to other town amenities.

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1- save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4- demolish	summary
63	Denis & Pamela	Cutler					x		<p>Strengthening the existing hall would not solve the problem. Trying to retain some elements would prejudice the outcome. It would be better to demolish the existing building for safety reasons and construct a new facility to modern standards, that meets the current and future needs of the community. Any new building would be better located closer to the square. Option 1: Strengthening an unreinforced masonry building will not be a long term solution, will likely cost twice as much as the estimate, and will leave community with a building that will require more work. Cites Christchurch and personal work as structural engineer. Option 2: If buildings were not originally constructed to the highest criteria, future generations should not have to suffer the consequences. Option3: This is the only realistic option. A replacement building should be specifically designed to suit the identified and affordable needs of the community (suggest library, meeting rooms, market space, Plunket rooms, toy library, etc). Suggest this new building be sited next to the museum, and could be built before demolition of the old hall, and staged to suit availability of funds. Option 4: Existing hall needs to be demolished before someone is injured or killed,</p>

Summary of Submissions – Martinborough Town Hall

sub no.	first	last	org	hearing	1-save old	2-save façade	3-new hall	4-demolish	summary
									but the community needs a suitable and affordable replacement.